
**ONE PLANET CARDIFF STRATEGY AND ACTION PLAN: PRE-DECISION
SCRUTINY**

Purpose of the Report

1. To provide Members with background information to aid the scrutiny of the draft report to Cabinet regarding the One Planet Cardiff Strategy Annual Review which is due to be considered by Cabinet at their meeting on 15th December 2022.

Scope of Scrutiny

2. At their meeting on 15 December 2022 the Cabinet will consider a report that provides an annual review of the One Planet Cardiff Strategy (OPC) and the agreed Action
3. The draft report to Cabinet entitled ‘One Planet Cardiff - Annual Review’ is attached at **Appendix A** and has **one** appendix:
 - **Appendix A1** - One Planet Cardiff – Council Action Plan, Review of Progress 2022
4. The Cabinet report is the main progress report which is then provided in a summary in the appendix A1.
5. During this scrutiny, Members have the opportunity to explore:
 - *The progress made to date;*
 - *Proposed changes to the action Plan*
 - *The recommendations to Cabinet.*

Background

6. As stated in the Cabinet report attached, Cardiff Council declared a climate emergency in 2019 in response to this the One Planet Cardiff Strategy was developed and published along with an action plan towards the end of 2021. The

Strategy sets out how we will respond and tackle this emergency and become carbon neutral Zero as a Council and a City by 2030.

7. Since its publication the new administration has published their 'Stronger, Fairer, Green' Strategy placing climate change at the heart of the Council agenda and internal Council policy has also been reinforced.
8. In September 2022 the Council debated and passed a motion in relation to climate injustice which called for the Council to become more 'globally responsible' in tackling climate change
9. The Cabinet report is the first review of the OPC strategy and action plan and **point 16** notes the inclusion of the first annual Operational Carbon Analyses findings from the Welsh Governments ambition for a Carbon Neutral public sector in Wales.

Issues identified in the Cabinet Report

10. The **Analysis of the Council's Annual Operation Carbon Emissions**, highlighted at **point 17**, notes the baseline data used was 2019/20 together with 2020/21 data to safeguard any skewing of the data due to the COVID-19 pandemic and associated restrictions and lockdowns
11. **Point 19** notes a change in the Welsh Government reporting framework methodology due to significant issues with the overall methodology – defined nationally - for calculating procurement emissions were noted at the time ¹.
12. Instead of the Scopes 1, 2 and 3 approach an activity based reporting structure will be used, under the following headings
 - Buildings
 - Fleet
 - Business travel, commuting and homeworking
 - Waste
 - Land based emissions and sequestration
 - Renewables
 - Supply chain (procurement)

¹ See www.oneplanetcardiff.co.uk for a fuller explanation of the 2021 Carbon Reporting methodology and terminology

13. Historical 2019/20 and 2020/21 data has been reworked using the new methodology for this first annual review,
14. However, as the methodology for calculating results has changed between reporting periods this means that direct comparisons with the council published baseline data and the current reporting year are problematic.
15. Comparison graphs are provided in **point 22** that relate to the previous categorisations i.e. Scope 1 and Scope 2 emissions and note a **13% reduction** in the Council's direct operational emissions between 2019/20 and 2020/21.
16. Issues in relation to the unusual circumstances regarding the Covid-19 pandemic are noted in **point 23**, which also notes that while directly comparable data is not available the 'general trend and observations' are reliable.
17. The rest of the annual review reports in using the new methodology and the chart at **point 25** shows a reduction in emissions of 4% over the last three years excluding those from the supply chain/procurement category
18. **Point 26** states building emissions have decreased over the three year period by 18%. The increase between 2020/21 and 2021/22 of 8% was anticipated following lifting of covid restrictions and buildings being opened.
19. Progress in relation to Street Lighting, **point 27**, notes a small increase in emissions between 2019/20 and 2021/22, despite the LED replacement and dimming programmes. During the pandemic there was a global shortage of electronic equipment which slowed progress and streets in new hosing developments will have been adopted growing the baseline figure.
20. Commuting and business travel emission reduced over the period due to the increase in on-line meetings.
21. The effect of newly planted trees on land emissions will not be seen until the trees start to mature.
22. **Point 30** highlights the issues that prevented better progress:
 - Fleet emissions - covid restrictions preventing vehicle sharing;
 - Inclusion of 'home -working' emission for the first time;

- For a short period a small amount of waste being sent to landfill due to breakdown of one of the handling plants.

23. **Point 32** states that although the significant majority of Councils operational carbon footprint relates to supply chain or procurement, due to the weaknesses in the methodology in assessing the impact an in depth review has not been included in the report. It also notes Welsh Government are undertaking work to improve the evaluation framework.

Analysis of Cardiff City-wide emissions

24. Local authority wide carbon emissions, (i.e. relating to all residents, organisations and visitors within the city boundaries) are published by Central Government’s Department for Business Energy and Industrial Strategy (BEIS). Data is collated on a calendar year basis with the most recent data available for 2020, indicating a whole city carbon emission of 1.6m tonnes CO2. Compared to 1.8 m tonnes in 2019

25. Comparison data of the percentage between sectors in 2019 and 2020 is shown in the table below

	Transport	Domestic	Industry	Commercial	Public sector	Waste Mgt	Agriculture
2019	41%	26%	17%	7%	5%	4%	1%
2020	38%	29%	17%	6%	5%	4%	1%

Modelling the Impact of our Projects and Plans – a ‘Pathway to Net-Zero’

26. **Points 35 – 42** describes the methodology used in the modelling to graphically show the impact on carbon emissions proposed projects will have over the years to 2030. Although the methodology currently excluded emissions in relation to procured goods and services.

27. A number of graphs illustrating scenarios are provided throughout the report. The first chart (**point 39**) shows the progress to date and then projects a “do nothing” scenario, relying solely on national predictions for grid decarbonisation. The resulting solid green line ²is then compared against two target lines showing

² This methodology takes the current actual/observed annual emissions data between 2019/20 and 2021/22 and uses the projected emissions conversion factors as issued by BEIS in 2021. Grid decarbonisation has actually occurred at a rate faster than shown in the BEIS 2021 projected conversion factors and explains the apparent increase in emissions in 2023. This is not an increase in overall emissions, but an adjustment as forecast emissions (which are higher than the actual recorded levels) take over from actual ones.

where the Council needs to be in the journey to net zero (one linear/straight (in red) with approx. 10% reduction per annum, and the other exponential/curved (in blue) which would involve deeper and more impactful interventions earlier on in the timeline). The gap between the green and red lines effectively represents notional annual targets for carbon savings.

28. This can be used as a baseline in the model and the impact of projects and programs over time will be shown by changes to the green/solid line. The graph in **point 40** demonstrated the impact of a number of ongoing projects including
- Building decarbonisation
 - Transition to low emission fleet
 - Replacing of all streetlighting to LED
 - Coed Caerdydd tree planting and biodiversity programme
29. **Point 41** highlights the projected significant gap of 20,566 tCO₂e that remains in 2030 after grid decarbonisation and the implementation of the schemes above.

ACTION PLAN REVIEW - Buildings

30. Emissions from council buildings and schools represent a major challenge as they rely on fossil fuels for heating and power.
31. **Council premises:(Carbon Neutral Council action) – Points 44 – 48** note the reduction in emissions of 55% between 2014/15 (40,00 tonnes) and 2021/22 (18,000 tonnes) (excluding leisure centres).
32. The current approved activity is not sufficient to address the reductions needed, therefore the Council has responded by:
- Starting to install smart meters in key buildings;
 - Developed a number of roof mounted solar schemes
 - Piloted installation of air source heat pump in a school, linking to solar generation and other efficiency controls to develop a prototype for a net zero retrofit
 - Commissioned work to design one of our new-build schools to Net Zero standards as a pathfinder for all future School construction;
 - Published a position statement on the Council's own new buildings which requires all commissions from 2024 onwards to be designed to net zero carbon standards; and

- Commissioned a study, drawing from the above data and pilots, to advise on a fully costed programme of retrofit activity across the whole estate over the rest of the decade.

33. **Domestic Premises:(Carbon Neutral City action) – Points 49 – 54** states the challenges in relation to this issue particularly in light of increasing fuel prices and the cost of living crisis, but notes the work the Council is doing in relation to domestic energy efficiency includes:

- A scheme to upgrade all council owned low-rise flats;
- Applying for and implementing any Welsh Government grant funds to support domestic retrofit schemes;
- Working with Cardiff Capital Region to support an additional scheme targeting Energy Company Obligation (ECO) funding towards households in fuel poverty

34. Also noted is the OPC target to retro fit 2,000 homes by 2024, however a foot note explains that this type of work is not included in that pathway analysis as it falls outside the remit of the Councils direct operational carbon footprint.

35. The construction of 40 new build Council Houses, due to be completed in 2023 have been designed to meet zero carbon standards. These will set the standard for all new Council homes in the future.

36. However, much of the domestic housing in Cardiff will fall outside the remit of many schemes, therefore that Council has a key role in lobbying and flagging up for resident's trustworthy sources of assistance.

37. **Points 53 and 54** highlight the potential in this area in relation to economic growth, skill development, as it approximates up to 10,000 houses a year may need some energy efficiency upgrades in the next 10 years and discussions are taking place at regional and national levels supporting a nationwide retrofit scheme, although a decision has yet to be made.

38. **City Scale Building Decarbonisation (Carbon Neutral City action) - Point 55** indicates that work is ongoing with partners on the Climate Emergency Board (CEB) to take forward the decarbonisation agenda across the organisations and to share and promote best practice.

39. The replacement Local Development Plan is also being shaped by OPC, sustainability and climate change

ACTION PLAN REVIEW - Mobility

40. As previously noted Government figures suggest transport emissions make up 38% of the City's carbon footprint. In relation to Council activity, transport emissions are the second highest with approximately 10,000 tonnes released in 2021/22.

41. **Council Mobility (Carbon Neutral Council action) - Points 57 – 61** note the Councils Fleet Transport Action Plan and the transition to electric vehicles. 53 vehicles are now electric, included 10 refuse collection lorries. The remaining vehicles will be replaced by 2025.

42. Transport emissions also include 'grey fleet' i.e. staff using their own vehicles for Council business. The decrease of 45%, in emissions between 2019/20 and 2020/21 in this area will as a result of covid and the change in working practices.

43. For the same reason emissions relating to staff commuting decreased by 17% over the same period. Although it is recognised that many staff groups are not able to work from home and need access to their work place.

44. The varied problems linked to the Councils 'mobility' are multifaceted and are allied to many polices. To focus on this a task and finish group has been established made up of key stakeholders whose task will be to develop a 10 year action plan that can be assessed and included in future modelling work Alongside this, evaluating operational needs and hybrid working to reduce superfluous journeys and incentivising a shift to active/low carbon travel choices.

45. **Citywide Mobility (Carbon Neutral City action) - Points 62 – 65** notes the progress in relation to the Transport White Paper and the Low Emission Transport Strategy which includes:

- Traffic calming and cycling infrastructure
- 36 electric buses, to be increased in 2023 with additional grant funding
- Improvements between Cardiff & Newport on the Newport Road corridor
- Electrification of railways and discussion on the South Wales Metro

- Introduction of 20 mph zones ahead of a roll out of the national scheme in September 2023
 - Active travel work in schools
 - Seventy Publicly accessible EV charging points installed in public car parks/residential areas with further roll out in development.
 - Regionally funded e3lectric taxi initiative
 - Consideration of a road user charging scheme to reduce the number of vehicles entering the city
46. The importance of Behaviour Change strategies is also noted along with the work of the Climate Emergency Board and partners organisations who are facing the same challenges to work together.

ACTION PLAN REVIEW – Supply Chain and Procurement

47. **(Carbon Neutral Council action) - Points 66 – 75** reiterate the reporting problems with procured goods and services which account for more than 80% of the Councils operational carbon footprint. Therefore, significant work has been done in trying to find solutions.
48. The Councils refreshed Socially Responsible Procurement Policy 2022-27 was approved recently and has carbon reduction at its core.
49. Examples of proactive carbon reduction procurement include the recent contract to build net zero schools, the roll out of LED lighting across the city and a recent road resurfacing scheme which specified the need for the contractor to use recycled low carbon materials.
50. It is recognised that that Council has many suppliers and smaller independents may not be able to move as quickly to low carbon solution , however we need to consider how they can be supported in this transition.

ACTION PLAN REVIEW – Waste and Recycling

51. **(Carbon Neutral City action) - Points 76 – 83** states the Council has been successful in removing the need for landfill and improving recycling activity.
52. It notes the difficulties of accurately reporting carbon benefits as recycling materials are handed to third parties to be processed. Consequently, WG require

calculations to be limited to waste that goes to landfill and some degree of transfer activity in handing waste over.

53. The recent approval of a new recycling strategy for the City is noted and it aims to :

- Increase recycling and participation
- Increase opportunities to recycle
- Improve the material quality of recycling sent for reprocessing
- Encourage and support prevention, reuse, repair of materials

54. A link to the Welsh Government website 'My Recycling Wales' is provided in **point 82**. This provides a range of information about recycling information in all local authorities in Wales.

55. The development of a Cardiff Circular Economy Network with Cardiff Metropolitan University and Celsa Steel UK and delivery of workshops and the engagement with schools to share resources and develop lesson plans to embed 'circular economy' principles across the curriculum.

ACTION PLAN REVIEW – Energy.

56. ***Renewable Energy Generation and Low Carbon Energy Distribution – Point 84*** notes the need to grow clean renewable energy sources, as despite the effort to reduce energy consumption, the growth in electric vehicles and heating solutions creates more demand.

57. ***Energy (Carbon Neutral Council action) – Points 85 – 87*** focus on the work the Council is has done and will undertaking in relation to renewable energy generation.

58. Proposals for two new energy generation schemes on Council land are noted, with business cases to be developed for approval.

59. ***Energy (Carbon Neutral City action) – Points 88 – 90*** mention the opportunities Cardiff has to support grid decarbonisation as it is a major landholder. The Lamby Way solar farm provides the equivalent zero carbon energy to power over 2,000 homes.

60. The heat from the Cardiff Heat Network that is currently under construction is expected in late 2023. This heat will not be from 'renewable' sources but is the result of a waste handling process that would otherwise be unused.
61. **Point 90** states that there is interest and support from the City Region and the [Western Gateway Group](#) (A pan region partnership from Swansea to Swindon and Cheltenham to Salisbury) in exploring tidal power generation in the Severn Estuary.

ACTION PLAN REVIEW – Green Infrastructure and adaptation to Climate Change (Carbon Neutral Council and City action)

62. **Point 91** refers to Coed Caerdydd project as a tool to deliver some of the ambitions in relation to land management and biodiversity in the OPC strategy, and notes that 22 hectares of land will have been planted by 2024 to support carbon gathering. The final outcome of the project is to plant 839 hectares however funding is only available until July 2023 with a bid for an additional 2 years funding being made to the Shared Prosperity Fund.
63. **Flood defence Points 92 – 95** – states Cardiff has a well formed flood defence programme that includes Sustainable Urban Drainage. It notes that work is ongoing with NRW to improve the water quality in the city including the three rivers, which will in turn improve biodiversity and lessen flood risk.
64. The Cabinet report also refers to coastal risk management programme which the committee considered in September 2022, and it notes construction is due to begin by the end of March 2023.

ACTION PLAN REVIEW – Food

65. An officer has been recruited to oversee the Cardiff Food Strategy 2021-24 which promotes healthy low carbon food. They will also engage with schools, communities and local SMEs.
66. **Council Food (Carbon neutral Council action) - Points 97 – 99.** Through schools 15 vegetable gardens have been built and a further 10 will be completed by the end of March 2023.

67. Over the summer 18 schools had kitchen upgrades, and this will be up to 40 by Christmas 2022. Investigation work is also ongoing to develop new low carbon sustainable healthy menus.
68. A proposed pilot in the County Hall Canteen has been delayed due to the implementation of hybrid working, however, discussions are on going to ensure the menu options reflect the council's food procurement, i.e. health low carbon choices
69. **City-wide Food (Carbon neutral City action) - Points 100 and 101** indicates the councils is looking at ways to use spare and underused areas of land and to make them available for community groups to develop food growing projects
70. The Cardiff City Region in partnership with Monmouthshire Council have begun a large food innovation project. It is a competition looking for creative ideas to local production and supply of environmentally sustainable food.

ACTION PLAN REVIEW – Behaviour Change – engagement & partnership – Point 102

71. The development of a wide program to address behaviour change is needed to support the OPC vision for the whole city.
72. **Council Staff Engagement (Carbon neutral Council action) – Points 103 – 105** discuss embedding low carbon values across all Directorates and making sure that all future decisions made have the least impact
73. Acknowledging the complicated cross cutting matters, under the direction of the Chief Executive a formal layer of control for the OPC strategy has been introduced that brings together key directorate leads to discuss cross cutting issues and settle and difficult issues.
74. The central role of schools is acknowledged and the development and they are being invited to develop their own Action plans as part of the One Planet Schools Pledge.
75. **City Wide Behaviour Change Initiatives (Carbon Neutral City action) – Points 106 – 111** notes the hope that whilst undertaking the work in schools the

pupils will become leaders for change and persuade their family and friends of the changes that need to be made.

76. The work of the Climate Emergency Board and key partners and the sharing good practice and supporting each other's work going forward so that key messages are strengthened and amplified.
77. It is also acknowledged that there is more work to be done to encourage behaviour change plans and approaches to better support this are being investigated. It is noted the Welsh Government are preparing a new Strategy for Public Engagement and Action on Climate Change and the Council will need to align any work with this.
78. Officers are preparing easily to understand, powerful messages to engage with citizens to ensure that everyone plays their part, and the Cabinet report states that in line with current Welsh Government guidance on Climate Change Engagement, we need *"to make the right thing to do the easiest thing to do"*,
79. **Council Pension Fund – Disinvestment away from High Carbon Activities and Fossil Fuels – Points 112 and 113** although the fund does not directly impact on the Council's carbon emissions it is eager to support ethical investment where possible. To support this the following has been undertaken:
- Increasing its proportional allocation of investment to the Low Equity Carbon Tracker fund and introducing a de-carbonisation overlay to a number of its Active Equity Funds
 - The potential for Disinvestment from companies representing a continuing risk who do not respond positively to engagement
 - The soon to be launched WPP Sustainable Equity Fund is expected to see an acceleration in positive investment in companies developing clean technology

CONCLUSION

80. Despite good progress being made in some areas the development of the suggested Pathway methodology indicates that there is still a lot of work to be done.

81. It is also uncertain what Government funding support will be available to the public and domestic sector to enable decarbonisation of buildings.
82. Global issues have impacted on the availability and price of components and vehicles to move forward with elements of the strategy.

Proposed Recommendations to Cabinet

83. The report to Cabinet contains the following recommendations:
 - i. Note the progress made on carbon reduction in the first year of One Planet Cardiff Action
 - ii. To approve the Pathway modelling methodology as a tool for onward monitoring and decision making
 - iii. To note and approve the refinement and progress of the One Planet Cardiff Action Plan
 - iv. To note and approve the intention to hold a Climate Change Convention in 2023

Previous Scrutiny

84. This Committee undertook initial scrutiny of the draft strategy at their meeting in December 2020. As well as hearing from the Leader, Cabinet Members and Officers from the Planning, Transport and Environment Directorate, the Committee also considered written submissions from stakeholder groups on the draft Strategy. Each of the stakeholder groups were also offered the opportunity attend the meeting to answer Member questions on the Draft One Planet Cardiff Strategy and the submission that they had provided. The stakeholder groups who agreed to take part in the meeting were:

- Cardiff University;
- Cardiff Youth Council Cardiff;
- Dwr Cymru;
- Labour for a Green New Deal (LGND);
- Natural Resources Wales;
- Size of Wales;
- Sustrans;
- Wales & Wests Utilities;
- Wales Co-operative Centre;

- Welsh Government Energy Services.

85. The Chair's letter from this meeting is attached at **Appendix B** contains a series of feedback comments as well as recommendations. These were structured into the following themes:

- Strategy Feedback
- Partnership and Governance
- Behavioural Change
- Covid Resilience
- Planning and Cardiff's Local Development Plan
- Local Sustainable Low-Carbon Food Supply
- Water - Usage and Drainage and its link to Climate Change
- Education and Engagement
- Trees
- Resources
- Transport
- Prioritisation
- Future Energy Solutions
- Procurement
- Regulation and Policy

86. The Committee also asked that their letter and the witness submissions be added to the other documents as a part of the wider consultation exercise for One Planet Cardiff.

87. At their Committee meeting on 11 May 2021, Members received a progress update on the development of the 'One Planet Cardiff' Strategy. Following their Scrutiny the following which they again provided a series of feedback comments around the following themes:

- Cost of Retrofit on Social Housing
- Wildlife Corridors
- Tree Planting
- Charging Points
- Public Consultation

- Electric Taxis
- City Car Club

88. A full copy of this letter and the response received from the Leader, Cllr Michael and Cllr Wild is attached at **Appendix C**.

89. Members received the proposed final draft of the One Planet Cardiff Strategy and Action Plan at their Committee meeting on 5 October 2021 and provided comments in relation to the following subjects:

- Behaviour Change
- Governance
- Carbon Neutral Building Developments
- Action Plan and Monitoring
- Financial Implications
- Dedicated Resource

90. A full copy of this letter and the response received from the Leader and Cllr Michael is attached at **Appendix D**.

Way Forward

91. Councillor Caro Wild, Cabinet Member – Climate Change and Andrew Gregory, Director of Planning, Transport & Environment have been invited to make a statement and answer Member's questions. These will be supported by further representatives from the Planning, Transport and Environment Directorate.

Legal Implications

92. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters, there are no direct legal implications. However, legal implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any legal implications arising from those recommendations. All decisions taken by or on behalf of the Council must (a) be within the legal powers of the Council; (b) comply with any procedural requirement imposed by law; (c) be within the powers of the body or person

exercising powers on behalf of the Council; (d) be undertaken in accordance with the procedural requirements imposed by the Council e.g. Scrutiny Procedure Rules; (e) be fully and properly informed; (f) be properly motivated; (g) be taken having regard to the Council's fiduciary duty to its taxpayers; and (h) be reasonable and proper in all the circumstances.

Financial Implications

93. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters, there are no direct financial implications at this stage in relation to any of the work programme. However, financial implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any financial implications arising from those recommendations.

RECOMMENDATION

The Committee is recommended to:

- i) Consider the information in this report, its appendices and the information presented at the meeting;
- ii) Determine whether they would like to make any comments, observations or recommendations to the Cabinet on this matter in time for its meeting on 15 December 2022; and
- iii) Decide the way forward for any future scrutiny of the issues discussed.

DAVINA FIORE

Director of Governance & Legal Services

2 December 2022